



Global Rights. Animal Rights

Max Planck Law: “Rights Realisation or Rights Inflation?”

Berlin/Heidelberg (online), 28 October 2020

Has “the balloon of human rights certainly popped” – as Makau Mutua claims?

I. What are rights ?

- Moral rights – legal rights,
- Legal rights as entitlements (*ius*) versus objective protective standards (*lex*).
- Legal rights as the basis of duties (not the other way round)
→ Multiple duties, multiple duty-bearers, open and dynamic content.
- Private law-based rights and public law-based rights.
- “Fundamental” rights and other rights.
- In domestic law and in international law.

II. Rationale of rights

- Dignity?
- Autonomy?
- Vulnerability?
- or: “without foundation” (Joseph Raz)?

III. Ongoing Extensions of Rights

1. WHICH rights? Notably the rise of social rights
2. HOW? Human Rights Based Approaches: consistent interpretation; human rights impact assessments; human rights mainstreaming.
3. Against WHOM? New duty bearers, notably business.
4. WHERE? Extraterritorial application.
5. WHOSE rights? The bourgeois, peasants, slaves, women, children, animals, nature. ...

IV. Critiques: Rights overreach, “rightsification”; rights inflation”; rights proliferation”

Cultural relativism; colonial legacy (Colin Samson); (neo-)Marxism: only superstructure; democratism; communitarianism and virtue ethics; hegemonic hypocrisy; neoliberalism.

V. Response: The work and benefits of rights

- Emancipation.
- Protecting body and mind.
- Broad legal standing and remedies.
- Fall-back position. → Culture of justification.

Cultural imposition?

→ Bottom-up empirical identification: <http://www.worldvaluessurvey.org/wvs.jsp>.

Rosa Luxemburg: „Freiheit ist immer Freiheit der Andersdenkenden“

Case law

Tercer Juzgado de Garantías Mendoza (Argentina), case No. P-72.254/15, 3 November 2016 - *Chimpanzee Cecilia*.
Constitutional Court of Colombia, T-622 of 10 November 2016 - *River Atrato*.
Islamabad High Court, Islamabad, W.P. No.1155/2019, *Islamabad Wildlife Management Board v. Metropolitan Corporation Islamabad*, 21 May 2020 [zoo elephant].

References

Anna Chadwick, *Law and the Political Economy of Hunger* (Oxford: Oxford University Press 2019).
Stephen Hopgood, *The Endtimes of Human Rights* (Cornell University Press 2013).
Samuel Moyn, *Not Enough: Human Rights in an Unequal World* (Cambridge: Harvard UP 2018).
Makau Mutua, „Is the Age of Human Rights Over?“ in: Sophia A. McClennen and Alexandra Schultheis Moore (eds), *The Routledge Companion to Literature and Human Rights* (London: Routledge 2016), 450-458.
Anne Peters, *Beyond Human Rights: The Legal Status of the Individual in International Law* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press 2016).
Onora O’Neill, *Justice Across Boundaries: Whose Obligations?* (Cambridge University Press 2016).
Etienne Mureinik, “A Bridge to Where? Introducing the Interim Bill of Rights“, *South African Journal of Human rights* 10 (1994), 31-48.
Eric Posner, *The Twilight of Human Rights Law* (Oxford: Oxford University Press 2014).
Joseph Raz, “Human Rights without Foundations“, in Samantha Besson and John Tasioulas (eds), *The Philosophy of International Law* (Oxford, Oxford University Press 2011), 321
Kathryn Sikkink, *The Hidden Face of Rights: Toward a Politics of Responsibilities* (New Haven: Yale University Press 2020).
Colin Samson, *The Colonialism of Human Rights: Ongoing Hypocrisies of Western Liberalism* (Cambridge: Polity Press 2020)
Christopher D. Stone, “Should Trees Have Standing? Toward Legal Rights for Natural Objects“, *Southern California Law Review* 45 (1972), 450-501.
Saskia Stucki and Visa Kurki, „Animal Rights“ in: Mortimer Sellers and Stefan Kirste (eds), *Encyclopedia of the Philosophy of Law and Social Philosophy* (Springer 2020).
Jacob Mchangama/Guglielmo Verdirame, “When Defending Liberty, Less Is More: The Danger of Human Rights Proliferation“, in: *Foreign Affairs*, 24 July 2013.